

George Orwell's *Animal Farm*: The Weaknesses of the Windmill Plan in a Self-Sufficient Farm

แอนนิมอล ฟาร์ม ของ จอร์จ ออร์เวล: ความบกพร่องของแผนสร้างกังหันลม ในฟาร์มพึ่งตนเอง

Khomduen Phothisuwan (คมเดือน โพธิสุวรรณ)*

Abstract

The study aims at investigating the weaknesses of the windmill plan, created by Snowball, the young male pig who is the main character, in George Orwell's *Animal Farm*. The qualitative method is used, and the results are presented in a form of a descriptive analysis. The study finds four weaknesses of the windmill plan portrayed as follows: 1) Snowball's lack of the real understanding of the windmill; 2) the disagreement on the plan of Napoleon, another young male pig and a main character; 3) the original sources of the windmill idea that are the books of humans; and 4) the farm animals' false hope of the benefits of the windmill. Also, the study finds the results of these weaknesses. Namely, the plan is developed too quickly, and it causes the problems of constructing the windmill. The clashes between Napoleon and Snowball arise while the behavior like humans of Snowball, including all pigs, is seen. Even, the benefits of the windmill belong to only humans. For the farm animals, they are left to keep on working harder and harder and facing hardships and difficulties such as blood and deaths in the Battle of the Windmill. It can be concluded that while planning the windmill construction, Snowball is embarking upon the oppression and exploitation of the farm animals in the land in which, as he promises, everyone will be treated as an equal.

Keywords: *Animal Farm*, Snowball, windmill, self-sufficient farm, weakness

บทคัดย่อ

งานวิจัยนี้ มีจุดประสงค์เพื่อศึกษาความบกพร่องของแผนสร้างกังหันลมซึ่งคิดขึ้นมาโดยสโนว์บอล หมูหนุ่มซึ่งเป็นตัวละครหลัก ในเรื่อง แอนนิมอล ฟาร์ม ของ จอร์จ ออร์เวล วิธีการวิจัยใช้วิธีการวิจัยเชิงคุณภาพ และเสนอผลการวิจัยด้วยการบรรยาย ผลการศึกษาพบว่า ความบกพร่องของแผนสร้างกังหันลมเกิดจาก 1) การขาดความรู้จริงของสโนว์บอลเกี่ยวกับกังหันลม 2) ความไม่เห็นด้วยของนโปเลียน หมูหนุ่มอีกตัวหนึ่ง ที่เป็นตัวละครหลัก 3) แหล่งข้อมูลที่เป็นแนวคิดของแผนซึ่งเป็นหนังสือของมนุษย์ และ 4) ความหวังที่เลื่อนลอยของสัตว์ในฟาร์มที่หวังประโยชน์จากกังหันลม นอกจากนี้ งานวิจัยยังพบว่า มีผลจากความบกพร่องของแผนนี้ด้วย

กล่าวคือ แผนเสร็จเร็วเกินไปและพบปัญหาในตอนก่อสร้างกังหันลม มีการขัดแย้งกันระหว่างสโนว์บอลและเนโปเลียน ในขณะที่พวกหมูทั้งหลายเริ่มทำตัวเหมือนมนุษย์ ยิ่งกว่านั้นยังพบว่า ผลประโยชน์อันเกิดจากกังหันลมตกเป็นของมนุษย์ สำหรับสัตว์อื่นๆ ในฟาร์ม พวกมันถูกทิ้งให้ทำงานหนักขึ้นเรื่อยๆ ประสบความคับแค้นและความยากลำบาก เช่น ความตายในสงครามกังหันลม สรุปได้ว่า ขณะที่วางแผนสร้างกังหันลม สโนว์บอลสร้างความเดือดร้อนและเอาเปรียบสัตว์ในฟาร์มอื่นๆ สัตว์ซึ่งพวกหมูเคยสัญญาว่าจะปฏิบัติต่อกันอย่างเท่าเทียม

คำสำคัญ: แอนนิมอล ฟาร์ม สโนว์บอล กังหันลมกัง ฟาร์มพึ่งตนเอง ความบกพร่อง

Introduction

George Orwell's *Animal Farm* was published in 1945, but the novel has still greatly gained popularity. *Animal Farm* is accepted as one of modern world classics. It has also been assigned in classroom and analyzed by literary researchers over the world such as Campbell (2000), Jordan (2007), Lamont, (2011), and Phothisuwan (2016). A book series of *Animal Farm* has been constantly published in 1959, 1960, 1962, 1963, 1964, 1965, 1966, 1968, and up to the present. Recently, the two latest versions are marketed in Kindle, a series of e-readers designed by Amazon.com—an American electronic and cloud computer company. One version entitled as *Animal Farm: Reader's Edition* is produced by Wildside Press and marketed via the kindle in October 5, 2011. Another one is produced by Kaf Publishing in the name *Animal Farm*, marketed in June 19, 2012.

There are various reasons causing *Animal Farm* to be popular among readers. First, the situations set up in *Animal Farm* are realistic. They satirize the political movements in Russian Revolution in which the Russian people had overthrown their tsar, the king of Russia. Thereupon, Lenin, a leader of the Bolshevik party and the first leader of the Soviet Union, took control of the country under socialism—an economic and political system in which the government owns large industries. Like the Russians, the farm animals overthrow cruel human owners after Major, the oldest male pig, has laid a Marxist regime and dies after that. Later on, Napoleon and Snowball, the two male pigs, establish themselves as new farm leaders and set up a Marxist community in which, as they promise, all animals are treated as equals. As time goes by, the clashes between these two pigs arise because they have different views of controlling the animals and managing the farm as a whole. When the clashes reach their peak, Snowball is exiled by Napoleon. With absolute power, Napoleon leads the farm by dictatorship and contributes to the downfall of the animals.

Another reason causing *Animal Farm* to be popular is a political aspect of a Marxist regime, demonstrated in the story. Marxism is a political and economic system, laid by Karl Marx (1818-1883)—a German economist, writer, and philosopher. The theory explains changes in history as the result of a struggle between two social classes—the working class and the capitalist class. Also, Marxism values equality and self-sufficiency—the ability to provide all things ones need without help from others—to lead a community to have happiness. In this case, *Animal Farm* presents a state of these senses.

In a much earlier time, Plato (428-347 B.C.), an ancient Greek philosopher, also stated about the ideal community in which residents can live happily under basic necessities. According to Plato, human beings need three basic categories—nourishing, protection, and ordering—to live well in an ideal land, “The just or ideal state meets 3 basic categories of needs: Nourishing (food, shelter, clothing), Protection (military, police), Ordering (leadership, government)” (“Plato”). In *Animal Farm*, Snowball and Napoleon, the two main characters, elaborate the Marxist ideology, laid by Major, another main character, to be Animalism—the political ideal that is claimed as a promise to bring better life to all farm animals. They lead the animals to form an ideal farm in which they can live with equality to share within three categories. The equality is found expressed in one of the commandments to confirm that everyone can live well. Such equality is seen in “All animals are equal” (Orwell, 2000: 17). This commandment means that all animals will be treated as equals. In such moment, everything will be equally shared, too. Then, Snowball and Napoleon draw up a list of commandments to organize the farm. They even establish themselves as new leaders to govern all animals.

Apart from the equality, the self-sufficiency is displayed in *Animal Farm* as well. It is seen clearly when Snowball offers a plan to build a windmill—a machine that harnesses the power of the wind to generate electricity—to use in the farm. For this case, John W. Campbell (2000: 30) notices that Snowball forms a self-sufficient farm through the idea of a windmill, “Organizes committees, constantly plans to ensure efficient operation of farm. Has visions of self-sufficient society in which, for example, windmill can harness natural power to serve animals.” According to Snowball, the windmill increases productivity, and the electricity generate by the windmill helps reduce the animals’ physical hard labor. However, before the benefits are shown, it causes the clashes between Napoleon and Snowball and even blood and deaths among the animals.

According to those unexpected results, this study aims at investigating the weaknesses of the windmill plan in George Orwell's *Animal Farm* in order to identify the problems arising from it. The study focuses on the weaknesses of the plan rather than the main characters because the windmill causes serious situations such as the *Battle of the Windmill* and the clashes between Snowball and Napoleon, the two main male characters. Also, the destruction of the windmill brings about the question why it has to be destroyed. In addition, as the construction workers, the farm animals never gain any benefits when the construction is complete. These draw much attention to analyze the windmill—the only technology in the story. The interpretation also leads to further conclusion why the windmill does not bring about better life, or in other words, why the ideal farm has never existed. Even worse, throughout the story, happiness—the ultimate outcome of the ideal state—never happens.

The findings of the study bring about various benefits as follows. First, the study helps readers to become well aware of the use of technology and its impacts on human beings. It also provides an understanding of life in this complex world. Meanwhile, the study helps readers to appreciate the value of literature while giving an alternative approach to analyzing literature.

Objectives of the Study

1. To investigate the weaknesses of the windmill plan in George Orwell's *Animal Farm*
2. To identify the results of these weaknesses

Data

This study uses data found in George Orwell's *Animal Farm* published by Penguin Books in London in 2000. The data is collected from not only the descriptions of the windmill and Snowball's characteristics and idea but also the dialogues between Snowball and Napoleon as well as Snowball and the farm animals, from beginning to end of the story. Also, other studies that are relevant to the objectives of this study are reviewed as useful sources of the data. Thereupon, the content consists the weaknesses of the windmill plan is considered.

Research Methodology

With a qualitative method, the research methodology includes an investigation and an appraisal of documentary sources about George Orwell's *Animal Farm* and the idea of sufficiency as well as self-sufficiency such as books, research reports, research articles, and critical articles. In the novel *Animal Farm*, the content based on the weaknesses of the windmill plan is gathered. After having collected the background information from those sources and searching what is found among previous studies, this study focuses on the process of the windmill plan created by Snowball, the young main male character, in order to find how and why the weaknesses are formed. Also, the results of those weaknesses are considered. To do so, the following three aspects are analyzed: 1) the descriptions of the windmill and the circumstances surrounding as well as the situations arising when planning, building, and using it; 2) the dialogues about the windmill, stated by Snowball and Napoleon, the two main characters; and 3) the narrations displaying the two main characters' actions that involve the windmill and the plan. Second, the data is analyzed by exploring the weaknesses of the windmill plan and the windmill itself. The study also presents the reasons or the impacts of those weaknesses. In this step, the extracts containing what the study is searching for are shown, and the analysis is presented in the form of descriptive analysis. Third, the discussion and the conclusion of the analysis are drawn.

Results: The Weaknesses of the Windmill Plan in a Self-Sufficient Farm

Snowball, one of the main characters, is a young male pig who offers the idea of the windmill—a machine that harnesses the power of the wind to generate electricity—to use in the farm. He is also a farm leader, sharing power with Napoleon, another main male character. In the first appearance, Snowball is described as a happy attractive and inventive pig with a lot of energy while being compared with Napoleon, “Snowball was a more vivacious pig than Napoleon, quicker in speech and more inventive, but was not considered to have the same depth of character” (Orwell, 2000: 10). Later on, this characterization leads Snowball to be demonstrated to believe in an ideal society and try many attempts to form it. In a sense of self-sufficiency, Campbell describes Snowball that he has a vision of a self-sufficient farm as, “Has visions of self-sufficient society in which, for example, windmill can harness natural power to serve animals” (2000: 30).

Besides Snowball, there is Napoleon, another young main male character, who shares power in the farm after the human owners have been exiled. Napoleon is portrayed with greed, brutal, determined, and ruthless characteristics as Campbell criticizes, “Greedy, determined pig who always gets his own way. Causes Snowball to be driven from Animal Farm, seizes power for himself. His rule is based on ruthlessness, propaganda. Assumes title of “Leader,” destroys opposition through bloody acts” (29: 2000). After Snowball has been exiled by Napoleon’s nine fierce dogs, he claims that the windmill idea is his.

According to Snowball, a self-sufficient farm has to be formed for common benefits of all farm animals. The word *sufficient* means fairly but not very or as much as is necessary or wanted or needed. The word *self* means one’s type, one’s character, and so on. In terms of a philosophy, *sufficiency* appeared as one of the keywords in *Sufficiency Economy Philosophy*, bestowed first in 1974 by His Majesty King Bhumibol Adulyadej, the king of Thailand at that time. The philosophy consists of three key elements: moderation, reasonableness, and self-immunity. In 1998 and 1999, the king also added knowledge and morality to be the two underlying conditions of the philosophy. According to the philosophy, Wibulswasdi, Piboolsravut, Pootrakool (2010) define the word *sufficiency* with its three core elements together with their capacity to protect people from the world changes as “Sufficiency means moderation, reasonableness, and the need for self-immunity to gain sufficient protection from impacts arising from internal and external changes”. On the other hand, a self-sufficient farm in this study just refers to a farm in which the majority of farm animals—the workers of the farm—have enough to live on without dependence on humans from the immense world outside. Also, knowledge—one of the two underlying conditions—is focused on as Snowball’s distinctive characteristic. In this study, knowledge refers to real knowledge and experience of what Snowball is doing—all about planning to build the windmill. In addition, morality—another underlying condition of the philosophy—is also considered. Morality is characterized as kindness, unity, honesty, justice, altruism, and patience sensed and practiced through moral awareness (Khomduen, 2016: 14). In fact, it is morality that has never been found in both main characters—Snowball and Napoleon.

As said previously, Campbell (2000: 30) describes Snowball that he has a vision of a self-sufficient farm which can be captured visibly through the idea of building a windmill. In the self-sufficient farm, all animals will live independently without help from humans, or in other words, with no control of humans. When Snowball offers the idea of the windmill, he points out the significant benefits of it such as doing farm work for them, “The animals had never heard of anything of this kind before (for the farm was an old-fashioned one and had only the

most primitive machinery), and they listened in astonishment while Snowball conjured up pictures of fantastic machines which would do their work for them” (Orwell, 2000: 35). After listening to Snowball telling them about it, the animals hope that the windmill will change their hard life not to be that hard anymore. In other words, the animals believe that the windmill is appropriate and helpful enough to reduce any physical hard work or any arduous tasks. Most of all, they believe that the windmill brings about better life. Snowball has not only the vision of a self-sufficient farm but also a technique to manipulate the animals to believe in his idea.

In an article entitled, “What is the Parody behind *Animal Farm* by George Orwell,” Katie Jordan (2007) notices that Snowball is intelligent. Jordan compares Snowball with a real human—Leon Trotsky who is a Russian political leader who had a significant role in the Russian Revolution in 1917. In Jordan’s view, Snowball is as intelligent as Leon Trotsky, as she describes, “He resembles the passionate, intelligent eloquence for which Leon Trotsky was so famous. He is a fervent ideologue, spreading the concept of animalism.” However, she points out that there is something obscured behind that intelligence. She makes this wondering clear by comparing Snowball’s characteristics with Napoleon’s. It is noticed that Snowball’s morals are still in doubt especially when considering his morals through the situations arising from offering the windmill idea, “His character, while significantly more morally-sound than Napoleon, is still flawed. His single-minded enthusiasm for big projects like the windmill might have resulted in despotism if he had succeeded” (Jordan, 2007).

Apart from Snowball’s characteristics and the idea of the self-sufficient farm in which the windmill will be built, the study finds some weaknesses of the windmill plan. In terms of this study, a weakness refers a fault in the plan of the windmill created by Snowball. The study finds that the weaknesses of the windmill plan can be categorized into four aspects as follows: 1) Snowball’s lack of the real understanding of the windmill; 2) the lack of the approval of Napoleon, another leader; 3) the original source of the windmill idea; and 4) the false hope of the benefits of the windmill.

First and foremost, one factor of the weaknesses of the windmill plan is Snowball’s lack of the real understanding of the windmill. The study finds that before coming up with the idea, Snowball reads many books, “Snowball had made a close study of some back numbers of the *‘Farmer and Stockbreeder’* which he had found in the farmhouse, and was full of plans for innovations and improvements”(Orwell, 2000: 35). However, the study also finds that the idea of the windmill is developed too quickly. Snowball finishes the plan within just a few weeks, as found in, “Within a few weeks Snowball’s plans for the windmill were fully worked out”

(Orwell, 2000: 36).

The lack of the real understanding of the windmill leads to the problems of constructing it. These problems have been seen just before Snowball finishes the plan. Namely, both the method and the process of the windmill construction are problematic. To construct the windmill, stone is needed. However, the study finds that Snowball still does not know how to carry and build the stone up into walls, “Snowball did not deny that to build it would be a difficult business. Stone would have to be quarried and built up into walls” (Orwell, 2000: 36). Also, Snowball does not know how to operate the machines that can help move the stones, “then the sails would be need for dynamos and cables. (How these were to be procured, Snowball did not say)” (Orwell, 2000: 36-37). All of the extracts reveal that Snowball does not understand the windmill well. His urgent action to create the plan reflects his carelessness and the lack of consideration. In details, he does not know how to move the materials used for constructing it. Even, he is not able to operate the machines used for the construction. That is, Snowball has just read the books and then immediately creates the plan of the windmill. Most of all, this implies that Snowball has never seen the real windmill throughout his whole life. When Snowball does not know how to move the stones and how to use the machine to make the stones move, this reflects some faults in the plan of the windmill. In other words, it shows the weaknesses of the plan. In terms of *Sufficiency Economy Philosophy*, this can be interpreted that Snowball lacks real knowledge when planning the windmill construction.

Second, unlike Snowball, Napoleon, another main character who shares power with him, does not agree with the idea of building the windmill. At first moment, Napoleon shows his disapproval by disagreeing about the work the animals have to do. Napoleon argues that, instead of building the windmill, the animals’ priority is increasing food production, “Napoleon, on the other hand, argued that the great need of the moment was to increase food production, and that if they wasted time on the windmill they would all starve to death” (Orwell, 2000: 37). Later on, after the plan of the windmill has been finished, the argument between Napoleon and Snowball is shown more clearly. Snowball strongly supports his own idea, “Snowball stood up and, though occasionally interrupted by bleating from the sheep, set forth his reasons for advocating the building of the windmill” (Orwell, 2000: 38). However, Napoleon immediately rejects the idea, “Then, Napoleon stood up to reply. He said very quietly that the windmill was nonsense and that he advised nobody to vote for it” (Orwell, 2000: 38). All extracts indicate that Snowball and Napoleon have different views about the windmill. When the plan is opposed by another one who shares a leadership position, it could

lead to problems. In a research article, Wachirasirodom and Tadanithi state about the importance of working together, “a sustainable livelihood strategy in Andaman coastal communities will depend on community members working together” (2016: 60). In the extract, Napoleon tries to stop voting for the plan, or in other words, to discredit Snowball. The windmill plan causes the problem, so there is something that is wrong with the plan which prevents it from proceeding smoothly. In addition, as unity is one of the meanings of morality, both Snowball and Napoleon present the immorality through this scene. In terms of *Sufficiency Economy Philosophy*, one underlying of a self-sufficient society is being ignored.

In addition to that, at that moment, Snowball and Napoleon portray their different views about the use of the animals’ hard labor. Snowball embraces the sense of living with more conveniences by creating and operating a machine while Napoleon focuses on increasing farm productivity by manual hard labor. Later on, the clashes between Snowball and Napoleon that have been developed increasingly along the story can be inferred that the windmill is one of the factors causing those clashes. The clashes even result in Snowball’s going into exile to escape Napoleon’s fierce nine dogs. As a result, the disapproval about the idea of the windmill between the two leaders can be categorized as one of the weaknesses of the plan. Most of all, it is also one of the weaknesses of forming the ideal self-sufficient farm.

Third, the study finds that the original source of the windmill idea is the books of humans which are found in the farmhouse. Also, the contents of the books are about farm mechanical tools and machines, “The mechanical details came mostly from three books which had belonged to Mr. Jones—‘One Thousand Useful Things to Do About the House’, Every Man His Own Bricklayer’, and ‘Electricity for Beginners’ (Orwell, 2000: 36). As the idea is taken from human books, Snowball offers the idea without any awareness that the machine is suitable and useful just for humans. When necessities of the animals refer to just food, shelter, and medicines, they do not need anything else even clothes or beds, as seen in two items of the seven commandments, “No animal shall wear clothes” and “No animal shall sleep in a bed” (Orwell, 2000: 17). In this sense, Snowball is trying to give the animals something more than necessities. In other words, the windmill idea is taken from the books accumulating humans’ knowledge, experiences, and practices. This means that the animals have never thought about it, yet Snowball still manipulates them to value it as significant. Therefore, the fault is that the plan put forth is unnecessary for the farm animals.

Additionally, humans invent machines and tools according to various reasons such as to serve them, to reduce hard labor, and to overcome difficulties and hardships. In *Wealth of Nations*, Adam Smith (2013) views machines as facilitators helping people to do more works,

“to the invention of a great number of machines which facilitate and abridge labour, and enable one man to do the work of many.” In the story, the book entitled *Farmer and Stockbreeder* provides humans the way to control and take the benefits from cattle. *Electricity for Beginners* guides the humans to generate or manage electricity to give power so that life becomes more convenient. *Every Man His Own Bricklayer* brings about the idea of building things by themselves. All of these provide humans the easier ways to increase productivity, marketable goods, and wealth. Meanwhile, these books guide the way to use machines to exploit the farm animals. In *Capital*, Karl Marx explains machines in terms of a capitalist concept that machines provide benefits just for the capitalist class—characterized as the human farm owners in the story, but not for the working class—characterized as the farm animals. Marx depicts the working class, dehumanized by the machines of the capitalist class in “Capitalism subordinates men to machines instead of using machines to liberate men from the burden of mechanical and repetitive work” (Marx, 1976). Like human owners, Snowball reads and uses the idea from those books. At that moment, he absorbs not only humans’ way of thinking but also the way of controlling and exploiting the farm animals. The books influence Snowball’s thinking which, of course, leads to his actions. Therefore, if the windmill is built, it will possibly be a tool of the pigs to increase productivity as well as differentiating the animals to be just subordinates. In this case, although it is the right thing for humans, the windmill plan is the wrong one for the farm animals.

The study also finds that while proposing the idea of the windmill, Snowball betrays his own belief. Such belief is that all humans are enemy. In fact, it is the belief that Snowball, including other pigs, tries many attempts to imprint it into the animals’ mind along the story. It has been repeatedly seen, for example, when Major, an old male pig who dies in the first scene, expresses the intense hatred of all humans, “Man is the only real enemy we have. Remove man from the scene, and the root cause of hunger and overwork is abolished for ever” (Orwell, 2000: 4). Another notable example that humans are identified as pigs’ enemies is presented in one of the seven commandments, “Whatever goes upon two legs is an enemy” (Orwell, 2000: 17).

As Snowball claims that he follows the path Major has laid, he has not to follow what humans behave or think. On the contrary, what Snowball has tried to do is to follow and even copy the humans. It is obvious that Snowball not only absorbs knowledge of humans but also leads the farm with that knowledge. These acts depict his attempts to follow and behave like the humans. For the portrayals, the study also finds that not only Snowball but also all

pigs behave like humans. Although Snowball is already exiled, all pigs still keep on behaving like humans, “The creatures outside looked from pig to man, and from man to pig, and from pig to man again: but already it was impossible to say which was which” (Orwell, 2000: 102). Therefore, Snowball’s use of the books of humans to be the original sources of the windmill idea implies that the benefits of the windmill are not needed by the animals. Even, the benefits are needed by Snowball, its creator, who thinks and behaves like the humans.

Fourth, a false hope of the benefits of the windmill indicates another one of the weaknesses. It is seen notably that Snowball has pointed out the benefits of the windmill, even before the windmill plan starts. First and foremost, he sets aside a place for the windmill while affirming its benefits to the animals and the farm as a whole, “Snowball declared that this was just the place for a windmill which could be made to operate a dynamo and supply the farm with electrical power. This would light the stalls and warm them in winter and would also run a circular saw, a chaffer-cutter, a mangel-slicer, and electric milking machine” (Orwell, 2000: 35). Thereupon, Snowball expresses the benefits of the electricity generating by the windmill to show its greater significance, “Electricity, he said, could operate threshing machines, ploughs, harrows, rollers, and reapers and binders, besides supplying every stall with its own electric light, hot and cold water, and an electric heater” (Orwell, 2000: 38). According to Snowball, the windmill brings tangible benefits to the farm as it is the machine that harnesses the power of the wind to generate electricity to supply power for all animals. Electricity contributes light and heat or electrical power that is used to operate a lot of farm machines. This results in reducing the use of animals’ hard manual labor while increasing productivity. That is, if it is built, the windmill will bring a lot of great benefits as well as much more conveniences to all farm animals. It is notable that all benefits of the windmill act as a reliable support for Snowball to build up a hope of a better life.

Despite the golden future claimed by Snowball, the benefits of the windmill are not seen throughout the story. On the contrary, the study finds the animals’ deaths and blood caused by constructing the windmill. In the Battle of the Windmill (announced by Napoleon), the animals protect the windmill by fighting against the humans who invade the farm. A lot of blood and deaths of the animals are found in the terrible scene, “This time they did not heed the cruel pellets that swept over them like hail. It was a savage, bitter battle. The men fired again and again, and when the animals got to close quarters, lashed out with their sticks and their heavy boots” (Orwell, 2000: 75). Even, the study also finds that after the windmill has been built, it is used for milling corn instead of generating electrical power as previously stated by Snowball. That is, it provides the benefits that are different from what Snowball used to say. Furthermore, one of

the benefits is providing profits to only humans, “The windmill, however, had not after all been used for generating electrical power. It was used for milling corn, and brought in a handsome money profit” (Orwell, 2000: 93). Even worse, the animals have never gained any benefits from the windmill, yet they still keep on working hard to build the windmills more and more, “The animals were hard at work building yet another windmill; when that one was finished, so it was said, the dynamos would be installed. But the luxuries of which Snowball had once taught the animals to dream, the stalls with electric light and hot and cold water, and the three day week, were no longer talked about” (Orwell, 2000: 93). All of these extracts make it clear that the benefits of the windmill are very different from what Snowball claims at the moment he plans it. Also, such benefits belong to only human beings. For the animals, they are still left to keep on building more and more windmills as well as working harder and harder on the farm productivity. Even worse, they still face hardships and difficulties because the machine they hope for does not bring any conveniences.

Therefore, the false hope of the benefits of the windmill reflects the downfall about having better life of all animals. Meanwhile, it reflects the weakness of the plan in case of building up the false hope for all farm animals. On top of that, maybe the two big faults are two wrong purposes. First, after the construction has been complete, the windmill is not used for generating electricity, but milling corn instead. Second, all the profits from the corn go to humans.

Discussion

The plan of the windmill is offered by Snowball, one of the main characters in George Orwell’s *Animal Farm*. The windmill is the machine that can harness the power of the wind to generate electricity. Snowball comes up with the idea after reading books of humans and declares that the electrical power from the windmill will make life better and help the animals to live independently. This idea obviously presents the propitious signs of self-sufficiency—the ability to provide all the things the animals need without help from humans—in the animal society. This is found consistent with Campbell (2000) who notices that Snowball has a vision of self-sufficiency. Also, it is consistent with Lamont (2011) who views Snowball as a young, smart, and good speaker as well as being idealistic. Also, Lamont reports that Snowball really wants to make life better for all. However, Jordan (2007) notices that Snowball’s morals are still in doubt especially when considering his morals through the situations arising from offering the windmill idea. Similarly, Khomduen (2016) views moral awareness when making discussion on the study about moderation and morality of a main

character in *Animal Farm* that it can be overshadowed and erased as “It is obvious that morality which is prosperous for a while is overshadowed and even erased. On the other hand, cruelty which creates its own cycle to stay eternity has played its role tirelessly and even can grow prosperously especially in civilized circumstances. (2016: 17).

Almost like Jordan (2007), the study finds that the windmill presents a dark side of Snowball. It is found that the benefits of the windmill are claimed by Snowball to manipulate the animals to believe in his leadership skill. On one hand, the idea of the windmill causes the animals not only to have hopes to survive independently and sustainably with their own technological advancement but also to enhance the opportunity to live in a higher standard. The benefits of the electrical power generated by the windmill also manipulate them to inherit the essence of the civilized society. In addition, the windmill is valued as an appropriate machine which can increase high productivity while reducing the animals’ physical hard labor. As a result, it can say that the windmill is used by Snowball to build up trust.

On the other hand, the windmill presents the materialistic ideal of capitalism. In the capitalist system, a machine is the infrastructural capital which is used by industries to generate much more productivity. In fact, the machine is one of the basic needs of profit-making capitalist exploiters. In the story, Mr. Whymper, a solicitor living in Willingdon, is only a person who gains profit from the productivity of the windmill, “The windmill, however, had not after all been used for generating electrical power. It was used for milling corn, and brought in a handsome money profit” (Orwell, 2000: 93). In terms of capitalism, the animals can be categorized as the working class who are exploited by the pigs and Mr. Whymper. The windmill never provides the animals anything; however, it leads much pain, suffering, and deaths to them. While Snowball is displaying his utmost care about the animals’ life, the windmill idea reveals the capitalist illusion he has nurtured. The benefits of the windmill taken by Mr. Whymper prove that the windmill is used as a tool to exploit the animals in terms of capitalist view as Ho Chi Minh, the greatest leader of Vietnamese Revolution in 1945, miserably affirmed that “Despite the differences in skin color, there are only two human races on earth: the exploiter and the exploited” (Xanh, 2008: 178).

For more interpretation, the windmill plan appears as Snowball’s tool, used in order to response his need of replacing humans. It is seen that Snowball keeps on acquiring knowledge from a wide variety of books containing with a lot of mechanical farm tools used by humans. This action can be interpreted that while Snowball is expressing the humans as the enemy, he is following and copying them. In other words, Snowball seeks knowledge to make him become a human. In addition, the comparisons between the actions of Snowball and

Napoleon help Snowball's depictions of replacing humans become more clearly. While Napoleon uses brutality, Snowball chooses to gain knowledge to make him appear intelligent. Also, while Napoleon secretly keeps the fierce nine dogs as his companions, Snowball secretly plans the idea of the windmill in order to show not only a brilliant but a self-sufficient idea. These imply that Snowball wants to portray himself as a leader who is concerned about the animals while differentiating Napoleon from him.

The weaknesses of the windmill plan reflect the weaknesses of Snowball's idea to form an ideal self-sufficient farm in George Orwell's *Animal Farm*. Being the main impetus to form the new farm management, the windmill, eventually, does not help the animals to have better life. The farm animals still keep on having hard life, and life is even harder when they try to construct the windmill. For the sense of equality, the windmill is the hope for the production and the benefits that are equally shared. Furthermore, they are treated as equals as found in the 7th commandment, "All animals are equal" (Orwell, 2000: 17). However, throughout the story, nothing is shared, and the equality is never found. The failure to reach such equality provides readers a lesson that an ideal land pursued does not become real. As part of Animalism, the plan of the windmill and the windmill itself do not bring good life.

The weaknesses of the Snowball's idea reflect the weaknesses of both Animalism in the story and Marxism in reality, too. There are some weaknesses in Animalism because it is pursued by the pigs, not by all farm animals. In other words, the farm animals have no chances to share their idea or affirm their common interests when forming the Animalism. This also reflects the weaknesses of a Marxist ideal because it is pursued by Karl Marx who never practices his theory. Like the farm animals, the working class mentioned in the theory has never shared any idea with Marx.

Despite the failure of such theories—Animalism and Marxism, there may be nothing wrong about the theory. The problem is that all beings are not the same. When they are grown-up, each of them has learned and absorbed different experiences and knowledge as well as encountering different events and actions. The differences cause them to think and act differently under the sense of an ideology. In other words, the benefits of a great theory may be blocked because of the differences of each human being.

Conclusion

This study focuses on investigating the weaknesses of the windmill plan created by Snowball, the main character, in George Orwell's *Animal Farm*. The windmill is planned to be constructed to harness the power of the wind to generate electricity. According to the plan, it will provide power for mechanical farm tools as well as serving light and heat for the animals and the farm as a whole. The windmill idea brings about the hope of living better and free from too heavy physical hard labor. This state can be classified as living in the self-sufficient farm in which the animals can live not only without help but also with no control of humans. However, throughout the story, the plan and the construction of the windmill result in more difficulties faced by the farm animals without exception for its pioneer—Snowball. The study finds that there are some weaknesses of the windmill plan, and the weaknesses can be categorized into four aspects. First, it is Snowball's lack of the real understanding of the windmill. This causes the plan to be developed too quickly, and it results in the problems of constructing it. Second, Napoleon, another main character who shares leadership with Snowball, does not agree with the plan. He argues that the main duty of the animals is to increase farm productivity rather than building the windmill. This even leads to the clashes between Napoleon and Snowball, and, finally, Snowball is exiled. Third, the original source of the windmill idea is taken from human books. It causes Snowball to absorb not only humans' way of thinking but also the way of controlling and exploiting the farm animals. Even worse, it leads him to betray his own belief—all humans are enemy. Fourth, another weakness is the false hope of the windmill benefits which have never appeared throughout the story. On the contrary, hardships and difficulties still belong to the animals such as the animals' deaths and blood caused by constructing the windmill found in the Battle of the Windmill. Eventually, the study finds that after the construction of the windmill has been complete, it is used for milling corn instead of generating electricity. Even worse, the profits from the corn belong to humans.

Recommendation

Those who are interested to study George Orwell's *Animal Farm* should focus on a capitalist theory that replaces a Marxist one in the story. The elements such as the bourgeoisie, the working class, and the environment that drive the theory should be analyzed as well. In addition, there should be more research that applies Sufficiency Economy Philosophy or a self-sufficient idea to analyze other literary works.

References

- Campbell, John W. (2000). **The book of great books**. New York: Barnes & Noble.
- Jordan, Katie. (2007). "What is the parody behind animal farm by George Orwell?." Accessed February 5, 2015. Available from <http://www.wisegeek.com/>
- Lamont, George J. (2011). "Animal farm - comparison of characters to the Russian revolution." Accessed January 12, 2015. Available from <http://site.iugaza.edu.ps/sbreem/files/2012/03/animalfarm/>
- Marx, Karl. (1976). **Capital**. London: Penguin Books. Kindle AZW file.
- Orwell, George. (2000). **Animal farm**. London: Penguin Books.
- Phothisuwan, Khomduen and Sutassi Smuthkochorn. (2016). "Morality and moderation of a leader in George Orwell's *animal farm*." **Rajamangala University of Technology Tawan-ok Social Science Journal**. 5, 2: (July–December): 11–18.
- Plato. Accessed December 27, 2013. Available from <http://Jmerritt.net>.
- Smith, Adam. (2013). **Wealth of nations**. Hertfordshire: Wordsworth ePublication. Kindle AZW file.
- Wachirasirodom, Rachakorn and SuWattana Tadanithi. (2016). "An analysis of sustainable livelihoods through community based tourism in Andaman coastal communities, Thailand." **Veridian E-journal, Silpakorn University**. 9, 4: (January-June): 48-62.
- Wibulswasdi, Chaiyawat, Priyanut Piboolsravut, and Kobsak Pootrakool, (2010). **Sufficiency economy philosophy and development**. 4th ed. Bangkok: The Crown Property.
- Xanh, Pham. (2008). **Ho Chi Minh: The nation and the times 1911-1946**. 2nd ed. Viet Nam: The Gioi Publishers.