Employee Well-being and Turnover Intention Among New Graduate Nurses in Hospitals in Dali, the People's Republic of China*

ความผาสุกของคนทำงานและความตั้งใจลาออกของพยาบาลจบใหม่ ในโรงพยาบาลของต้าหลี่ สาธารณรัฐประชาชนจีน*

ลี่	ชุยเฉียน**	Li	Cuixian**
อรอนงค์	วิชัยคำ***	Orn-Anong	Wichaikhum***
กุลวดี	อภิชาตบุตร****	Kulwadee	Abhicharttibutra****

Abstract

Employee well-being is an important factor in turnover intention among new graduate nurses. This descriptive correlational study aimed to describe employee well-being, determine the level of turnover intention, and examine the relationship between employee well-being and turnover intention of new graduate nurses in hospitals in Dali, the People's Republic of China. The sample consisted of 260 new graduate nurses working in three Dali hospitals. The research instruments were the Chinese version of the Employee Well-being Scale (EWBS) and the Turnover Intention Questionnaire (TIQ). The Cronbach's alpha of the EWBS and TIQ were 0.94 and 0.89, respectively. Descriptive statistics and Spearman's rank-order correlation were used for data analysis.

Results revealed that the overall mean score of employee well-being of new graduate nurses was 3.97 (SD = .72). Turnover intention of new graduate nurses was at a moderate level ($\overline{X}$ = 3.77, SD = .96). There was a significant negative relationship between employee well-being and turnover intention ($r = -.341$, $p < .01$).

The findings of this study could provide baseline data for nurse administrators to design strategies to improve employee well-being and minimize the turnover intention of new graduate nurses.

Key words: Employee well-being; Turnover intention; New graduate nurses

* Master's thesis, Master of Nursing Science program (International Program), Faculty of Nursing, Chiang Mai University

** Graduate Student of Nursing Science program (International Program), Faculty of Nursing, Chiang Mai University

*** Corresponding author, Assistant Professor, Faculty of Nursing, Chiang Mai University; e-mail: orn-anong.w@cmu.ac.th

**** Associate Professor, Faculty of Nursing, Chiang Mai University

Received 1 May 2019; Revised 8 July 2019; Accepted 1 August 2019

บทคัดย่อ

ความผาสุกของคนทำงานเป็นปัจจัยสำคัญของความตั้งใจลาออกในพยาบาลจบใหม่ การศึกษาแบบพรรณนาหาความสัมพันธ์นี้มีวัตถุประสงค์เพื่อศึกษาความผาสุกของคนทำงาน ระดับของความตั้งใจของการลาออก และความสัมพันธ์ระหว่างความผาสุกของคนทำงานกับความตั้งใจลาออกของพยาบาลจบใหม่ในโรงพยาบาลเมืองต้าหลี่ สาธารณรัฐประชาชนจีน กลุ่มตัวอย่างคือพยาบาลจบใหม่จำนวน 260 คนที่ทำงานในโรงพยาบาล 3 แห่งในเมืองต้าหลี่ เครื่องมือวิจัยประกอบด้วยแบบวัดความผาสุกของคนทำงานฉบับภาษาจีน (Chinese version of the Employee Well-being Scale: EWBS) และแบบสอบถามความตั้งใจลาออก (Turnover Intention Question- naire: TIQ) โดยมีค่า Cronbach's alpha ของ EWBS และ TIQ เท่ากับ 0.94 และ 0.89 ตามลำดับ วิเคราะห์ข้อมูลโดยใช้สถิติพรรณนา และสถิติ Spearman's rank-order correlation

ผลการศึกษาพบว่าค่าคะแนนเฉลี่ยของความผาสุกของคนทำงานโดยรวมของพยาบาลจบใหม่เท่ากับ 3.97 (SD = .72) ส่วนความตั้งใจลาออกของพยาบาลจบใหม่อยู่ที่ระดับปานกลาง ($\overline{X}$ = 3.77, SD = .96) และความผาสุกของคนทำงาน และความตั้งใจลาออกมีความสัมพันธ์เชิงลบอย่างมีนัยสำคัญทางสถิติ (r = -.341; p < .01)

ผลการศึกษานี้เป็นข้อมูลพื้นฐานสำหรับผู้บริหารทางการพยาบาลในการออกแบบกลยุทธ์เพื่อส่งเสริมความผาสุกของคนทำงานและทำให้ความตั้งใจลาออกของพยาบาลจบใหม่ลดน้อยลง

คำสำคัญ: ความผาสุกของคนทำงาน ความตั้งใจลาออก พยาบาลจบใหม่

* วิทยานิพนธ์หลักสูตรพยาบาลศาสตรมหาบัณฑิต (หลักสูตรนานาชาติ) คณะพยาบาลศาสตร์ มหาวิทยาลัยเชียงใหม่
** นักศึกษาหลักสูตรพยาบาลศาสตรมหาบัณฑิต (หลักสูตรนานาชาติ) คณะพยาบาลศาสตร์ มหาวิทยาลัยเชียงใหม่
*** ผู้เขียนหลัก ผู้ช่วยศาสตราจารย์ คณะพยาบาลศาสตร์ มหาวิทยาลัยเชียงใหม่ e-mail: orn-anong.w@cmu.ac.th
**** รองศาสตราจารย์ คณะพยาบาลศาสตร์ มหาวิทยาลัยเชียงใหม่

วันที่รับบทความ 1 พฤษภาคม 2562 วันที่แก้ไขบทความ 8 กรกฎาคม 2562 วันที่ตอบรับบทความ 1 สิงหาคม 2562

Background and significance

In recent years, the demand for nurses has caused more and more of a shortage of nurses that is becoming an increasingly significant global problem (Oulton, 2006). The shortage of nurses worldwide will continue to rise (Takase, 2010) due to the ageing of the global population; the rapid growth of the community care and home care industries; the improvement of living standards; the increased demand for children's health care; and the changes in the disease spectrum. The demand for chronic care for adults has also increased (Oulton, 2006). These have greatly increased the demand for nurses. In the US, it is estimated that by 2020, a nursing shortage of approximately 36% is expected. The shortage of nurses in the United States will reach 800,000 and the shortage of nurses in Europe will reach 590,000 (Nurses International, 2011). In China, approximately 88% of hospitals had a nursing shortage and the average vacancy rate of nursing positions was about 27.5%. By the end of 2017, the total number of registered nurses in China was 3.8 million. The ratio of nurses was 2.74 per 1000 people with the ratio of doctors and nurses nationwide being at 1: 1.1. The ratio of doctors and nurses for tertiary hospitals was 1:1.54 and the ratio for secondary hospitals was 1: 1.46, which is still far from the international standard of 1: 2 (People's Health Network, 2018).

Nurse turnover is another important factor in the global shortage of nurses (De Gieter, Hofmans, & Pepermans, 2011), especially for new graduate nurses' turnover because the turnover of new graduate nurses is more significant. In order to avoid the early escape of new nurses in the USA during the nursing shortage in the early 1980's, where 35-60% of new graduate nurses quit their job within the first year of graduation (Hamilton, Murray, Lindholm, & Myers, 1989). The turnover rate of nurses was 20% in the US (Nurses International, 2011). American scholars reported a higher rate of 26.2% of new graduate nurses resigning within two years of starting their job (Kovner, Brewer, Yingrengreung, & Fairchild, 2010). In Taiwan, the yearly turnover rate of new graduate nurses was about 28%, while in Taipei it was as high as 47.7%. (Cheng, Tsai, Chang, & Liou, 2014). In China, the turnover rate of nurses was 10.2-11.2% (Modern Nursing, 2018). A study reported that some tertiary hospitals have the highest turnover rate for new graduate nurses with 2 to 5-year work experience, accounting for 47.87% of the total of nurses who had resigned (Xu, Ding, Lv, Wen, & Li, 2016). Another study reported by Mai, Zhai, Liao, and Huang (2016) in Guangzhou tertiary hospitals of China showed that nurses with 1 to 2 years' work experience occupied 54.3% while those with less than 5 years' work experience occupied 76.7% of turnover intention. These two reports also indicate that the turnover rate of new nurses is higher than the nurse group as a whole. All data showed that nurses were more likely to quit early on in their career.

Mobley (1977) defined turnover intention as the voluntary intention of an employee to leave an organization. Mobley's model is a rethinking process of turnover. The structure of the turnover intentional model includes thinking of quitting which means the idea of leaving the current job caused by the dissatisfaction towards the current job; the intention to search which

means that the employee's turnover idea is motivated by looking for other job opportunities, then initiate comparing and assessing other opportunities; and the intention to quit which means employees already have some other job or plans that are more interesting, but they are still considering their options and the employee then decides to leave the organization at some unspecified point in the future. In this process, the dissatisfaction towards the current work will motivate employees' turnover and the process is done before the actual turnover behavior occurs. Several general predictions by Mobley (1977) indicate that the best predictor of turnover should be the employee's turnover intention. Turnover intention has been identified as the best immediate predictor for actual turnover behavior and has been proven both theoretically and practically (Alexander, Lichtenstein, Oh, & Ullman, 1998; Fishbein & Ajzen, 1975; Pack, Roessler, Turner, & Robertson, 2007).

In general, a new graduate nurse refers to a nursing student who has just graduated. Many researchers consider a nurse with little work experience as a new graduate nurse, but there is no uniform standard of researchers defining new graduate nurses. Benner's (1984) "expert novice" theory considers a new graduate to be an advanced beginner, newly graduated in nursing and in need of a transitional period before they can become a qualified clinical nurse. In other words, even if nurses obtain a nurse qualification certificate after graduation, it will take them a period of time to adapt to clinical work. There were two main ways to define new graduate nurses from the literature review. One was to define a sample of a new graduate nurse as a nurse with less than 1 year of experience (Cheng et al., 2014; Lee, Lim, Jung, & Shin, 2012; Ortiz, 2016; Parker, Giles, Lantry, & McMillan, 2014). Another one was to define a new graduate nurse as a nurse with less than 3 years of experience (Fallatah, Laschinger, & Read, 2017; Giallonardo, Wong, & Iwasiw, 2010; Laschinger, Grau, Finegan, & Wilk, 2012; Vogelpohl, Rice, Edwards, & Bork, 2013).

The new graduate nurses are the main human resources to alleviate the shortage of nurses (Buerhaus, Auerbach, & Staiger, 2009). In China, as of the end of 2015, the number of registered nurses in a population of 1,000 increased from 1.52 to 2.36 compared with 2010. The increase in new nurses greatly eased the shortage of nurses and improved the quality of care (National Ministry of Health Statistics, 2016).

New graduates have been reported to face high stress and challenges when they transition from school to their first work setting (Duchscher, 2009). Some studies have shown that most new graduate nurses lack academic and practical skills, judgment, and decision-making skills (Duchscher, 2008). Therefore, the transition from student roles to real nursing work at the hospital is a stressful experience (Gerrish, 2000). All kinds of work-related stress have a negative impact on the employee's well-being (Lu, Kao, Siu, & Lu, 2011). Employees experiencing poor well-being in the workplace may be prone to more turnover (Boyd, 1997).

Throughout history, philosophers considered well-being as the best thing in terms of ultimate motivations for human actions (Diener, 1984). According to the literature review, if employees have a higher level of employee well-being, employee turnover intention will be

lower. Human beings have been striving for well-being since ancient times (Zheng, Zhu, Zhao, & Zhang, 2015). Employee well-being is critical to the survival and the development of organizations around the world (Spreitzer & Porath, 2012). Well-being in the workplace is beneficial not only to the employees but also to the employers, organizations, our community and our society (Warr, 2007). Employees experiencing poor health and well-being in the workplace may be less productive, make decisions of poorer quality, and be more prone to turnover (Boyd, 1997).

Dali is located in the western part of Yunnan province. There are three major hospitals in Dali. No official information on new graduate nurses' turnover rate in the Dali area was found. However, human resources statistics of the first affiliated Hospital of Dali University showed that 69.93% of nurses' turnover rate concerned those who had been working for less than one year. The data indicated that the turnover rate among new graduate nurses was higher and that nurses were more likely to quit their job early on their career life in Dali. Although some studies have been done in other regions, only one study by Li, Akkadechanunt, and Chontawan (2011) was conducted in Yunnan province. The results reported that the Kunming University Hospitals of Yunnan were at a moderate level of turnover intention however it didn't focus on new graduate nurses. No study on employee well-being and turnover intention in the Dali area exists. Because of the fact that different regions, different levels of hospitals, different nurses' formation trigger different levels of turnover intention (Yang, Yan, Zhou, Wang, & Lv, 2014), Li et al.'s (2011) study cannot explain the level of turnover intention in the Dali region, especially among the new graduate nurses' group. In summary, this study provides the first practical evidence to prove the level of turnover intention of new graduate nurses and is the first study to explore the employee well-being of new graduate nurses in the Dali area.

Research Objectives

This study aimed to describe employee well-being, determine the level of turnover intention, and examine the relationship between employee well-being and turnover intention of new graduate nurses in Dali Hospitals, the People's Republic of China.

Conceptual Framework

Employee well-being (EWB) in this study was based on the employee well-being theoretical model (Zheng et al., 2015). EWB refers to the perceptions and feelings of a new graduate nurse about their satisfaction towards work, personal life and psychological experience. It consists of three dimensions which are life well-being (LWB), workplace well-being (WWB), and psychological well-being (PWB). Turnover intention (TI) in this study was based on the turnover intention theoretical model (Mobley, 1977). TI is defined as the voluntary intention of a new graduate nurse to leave a hospital. The structure of turnover intention includes thinking of quitting, the intention to search, and the intention to quit. The relationship between employee well-being and turnover intention is described in this study.

Methodology

A descriptive correlational research design was used to examine employee well-being, turnover intention and the relationship between employee well-being and turnover intention of new graduate nurses in hospitals of Dali, the People's Republic of China.

Population and Sample

The target population for this study was 470 new graduate nurses with less than three years of working experience, currently working in the three main hospitals of Dali, the People's Republic of China, including the First Affiliated Hospital of Dali University, the People's Hospital of Dali Bai Autonomous Prefecture, and the First People's Hospital.

A proportionate stratified sampling method was used to select nurses from each hospital. A simple random sampling method was used to select new graduate nurses from the name list of new graduate nurses in the nursing department of each hospital. This study was calculated using the formula of Yamane (1973). Considering the loss of samples, 30% of the sample size (65) was added (Israel, 1992) into the sample, making 281 new graduate nurses in total. Finally, a total of 260 (92.53%) questionnaires were completed for analysis.

Research Instruments

The research instruments that were used in this study can be divided in three parts.

1. The demographic data form. It includes age, marital status, education level, work department, job orientation period, preceptorship program, and work duration. The questions for age and working duration are open-ended; the others are close-ended questions.

2. The Chinese version of the employee well-being scale developed by Zheng et al. (2015) and consisting of 18-items with a 7-point Likert-type scale (1 = strongly disagree to 7 = strongly agree). The mean score was used to explain employee well-being. Although it was not developed by nursing practitioners, the model and the instrument developed were used in a wide range of Chinese organizations and were more suitable for measurement within Chinese organizations. Therefore, this new scale provides a high reliability and high validity scale for assessing employee well-being in Chinese organizations.

3. The turnover intention questionnaire developed by Jacobs and Roodt (2008) consisting of 14-items with a 7-point intensity response scale ("never" = 1 indicated low intensity and "always" = 7 indicated high intensity). The Chinese version was translated by Li et al. (2011). Items were summed and the mean score was reported and classified into low (mean score 1.00-3.00), moderate (mean score 3.01-5.00) and high (mean score 5.01-7.00) levels.

The validity of the two scales was assured by the developer. Both scales were used in the present study without any modification. Therefore, the researcher did not test validity in this study. Before distributing questionnaires, the reliability of the Chinese version of the EWBS and TIQ was tested again with 20 new graduate nurses who had similar characteristics as the samples in this study. The Cronbach's alpha coefficients of EWBS (life well-being was 0.88; workplace well-being was 0.92; psychological well-being was 0.92) and TIQ were 0.94 and 0.89, respectively.

Ethical Considerations

The research proposal was approved by the Research Ethics Review Committee, Faculty of Nursing, Chiang Mai University, Thailand. The IRB number is 053/2019. Approval of this study was obtained prior to data collection. Then, approval was obtained from the three of Dali hospitals. All study subjects were informed of the purpose of the study and a consent form with the full details of the study was provided in the questionnaire. They were told that participation was voluntary and free, they could refuse to participate or withdraw from the study at any time, their withdrawal would not have any impact on their job evaluation and the process of collecting data ensured that there was no physical or psychological harm and risk.

Data Collection

After receiving approval from the Research Ethics Review Committee, the research package, including the research proposal, a cover letter, a request for permission for data collection was forwarded to the directors of the hospitals and then permission for data collection was also requested. The researcher met deans and directors of nursing departments of the selected hospitals to inform them about the research, its purposes and the benefits of the study and requested to be assigned a coordinator in each hospital. The questionnaires were distributed to nurses by the researcher and the coordinators and subjects were requested to return the questionnaire within two weeks. A total of 266 questionnaires were returned with a response rate of 94.66 %, finally 260 (92.53%) questionnaires were completed for analysis.

Data Analysis

Data were analyzed using a statistical software package. Frequency, percentage, mean and standard deviation were used to analyze the descriptive data. Spearman's rank-order correlation test was used to examine the relationship between employee well-being and turnover intention because the data of employee well-being was normally distributed.

Results

1. The age range of new graduate nurses was from 20-31 years, and the average age was 24.83 (SD = 2.12); the majority of samples were aged between 20-25 years (60.00%). The gender was male at 8.08% and female at 91.92%. There were 80 (30.77%) new graduate nurses who were married and 180 (69.23%) new graduate nurses who were single. There was only one new graduate nurse without any job orientation period, and 91.92% of new graduate nurses had received instruction by a preceptorship program.

2. Table 1 indicates that the overall mean score of employee well-being of new graduate nurses was 3.97 (SD = .72). In addition, the mean scores of the three dimensions of employee well-being were 3.81 (SD = .81) for life well-being, 3.79 (SD = .90) for workplace well-being and 4.33 (SD = .75) for psychological well-being. Table 2 indicates that the mean score of turnover intention of new graduate nurses was at a moderate level ($\bar{X}$ = 3.77, SD = .96).

3. As shown in Table 3, overall employee well-being had a moderate negative correlation with turnover intention ($r = -.341$, $p < .01$). In addition, life well-being had a moderate negative

correlation with turnover intention (r = -.307, p < .01), workplace well-being had a moderate negative correlation with turnover intention (r = -.334, p < .01) and psychological well-being had weak negative correlation with turnover intention (r = -.267, p < .01).

Table 1 Mean and Standard Deviation of Employee Well-being of the Samples (n = 260)

Variable	Mean	SD
Overall employee well-being	3.97	0.72
Life well-being	3.81	0.81
Workplace well-being	3.79	0.90
Psychological well-being	4.33	0.75

Table 2 Mean Standard Deviation and Level of Turnover Intention of the Samples (n = 260)

Variable	Mean	SD	Level
Turnover intention	3.77	0.96	Moderate

Table 3 Relationship between Overall Level of Employee Well-being and Turnover Intention of the Samples (n = 260)

Employee well-being	Turnover intention
	r
Overall employee well-being	-0.341**
Life well-being	-0.307**
Workplace well-being	-0.334**
Psychological well-being	-0.267**

*p < .01

Discussion

1. Employee Well-being

The results of this study showed that the overall mean score of employee well-being as perceived by new graduate nurses in the Dali hospitals was 3.97 with SD of 0.72. Some previous studies, using the same instrument to measure employee well-being were found but only in a small amount of other fields and unfortunately none were found in the nursing field. Therefore, there is no comparison between nurse groups, but these results can be compared with other fields and some meaningful points can be found. There is a total of four other different areas of

employee well-being related research to be compared with the new graduate nurses' sample. First, a study focusing on a national equipment manufacturing company in China and conducted by Zheng et al. (2015) showed a mean score of 4.77 (score range 1-7) of employee well-being with SD of 0.82. Second, a study focusing on an outdoor sport clothing manufacturing company in China and conducted by Zheng et al. (2015) showed that the mean score of employee well-being was 5.15 (score range 1-7) with SD of 0.76. Thirdly, Zheng and Liu (2016) conducted a study that focused on employees of a manufacturing enterprise in northern China, which showed that the mean score of employee well-being was 4.92 (score range 1-7) with SD of 0.81. Fourthly, an online survey involving employees in different working fields of many cities in China and conducted by Wang and Wang (2016) showed that the mean score of employee well-being was 4.67 (score range 1-7). Once the above findings were summarized, they indicated that new graduate nurses scored lower on employee well-being than employees in these four other fields. This result could be explained by the nature of nursing itself. Health professionals are a group with significant risks because they are facing life and death. Nurses are exposed to a large number of powerful stressors every day, including conflicts with patients and doctors, discrimination, heavy workload, handling deaths, as well as patients and their families (Mark & Smith, 2012).

The mean score of employee well-being of new graduate nurses was 3.97 (Table 1); even though the researchers who developed the employee well-being instrument did not classify it, the score ranged from 1-7, indicating that this is a median mean score. Therefore, the mean score was not a very low score but lies with the mean scores of the three dimensions of employee well-being ranging from 3.81-4.33 (Table 1). Some explanations from the three dimensions of employee well-being can be explained as follows.

First, the mean score of psychological well-being was 4.33 (Table 1) which was the highest of the three dimensions of employee well-being. Psychological well-being mainly focuses on learning, growth, and self-actualization (Zheng et al., 2015). This result could be explained by the selected hospital grades. The three hospitals selected by the Institute are three tertiary hospitals in Dali City, which have the highest comprehensive level in the local area. Therefore, nurses have more learning opportunities, new knowledge and new ideas to improve themselves and tertiary hospitals provide better services for career success and self-actualization.

Second, the mean score of workplace well-being was 3.79 (Table 1) which involves all the elements related to work. In Dali, compared to other hospitals, the three hospitals represent the best in the environment, have the best equipment and constitute the most complete hospitals for employees' benefits as well as in terms of security systems.

Finally, the mean score of life well-being was 3.81 (Table 1) which could show that the return to the family after work is a way to decompress; because 69.23% of the new graduate nurses in this study are single, it may indicate that they have fewer responsibilities than nurses with families or nurses who are married or have children, so they can better accompany family and friends.

However, the mean score was not a very high score. The explanations lie with some demographic characteristics of this sample, for reasons that could be explained as follows.

First, Lu et al. (2011) indicated that older employees had better well-being and this study actually sampled new graduate nurses with an average age of less than 25 while 60% of the age range was 20-25. The attribute of this sample indicates that the average age is young. This explanation could be related to some actual situations in the working environment of Chinese nurses. For example, older nurses have fewer night shifts than new nurses.

Secondly, Lu et al. (2011) indicated that senior employees had better well-being than junior employees. The participants in this study all had less than 3 years of work experience which indicated that all of them were junior nurses. In general, senior nurses have more work experience than junior nurses and have more self-confidence at work.

Thirdly, Lu et al. (2011) also proved that managers had better well-being than ordinary employees. The samples of this study are all ordinary nurses and none of them are managers. In China, nurses and head nurses both have a lot of work pressure, but the scope of work is different. In addition, in terms of personal values, the upgrade from nurse to head nurse is also an increase in personal value.

Fourthly, a study conducted by Ryu (2016) proved that higher education level employees had better well-being. The highest percentage of the sample education level in this study is associate degree (55.77%), followed by bachelor degree (38.46%) and diploma degree (5.77%), while there is no record of master degree and doctor degree. The education level of this sample is on the medium to lower side. Higher educated nurses have a wide range of knowledge, solid theoretical foundation, self-confidence, insights, ability and obvious advantages in the work of rescue and scientific research. Thus, leaders can better appreciate them and get more opportunities to improve higher educated nurses (Wang, Zhang, & Liu, 2003).

In addition, Ryu (2016) also proved that employees with a higher salary had better well-being. In China, in general, the salary of a nurse is divided into different levels according to the length of work, title, education, position and so on (Baidu Library, 2018). The nurses in this sample have all been working for no more than three years and they are all ordinary employees. They are the lower-income group of nurses in the three hospitals. Therefore, new graduate nurses with low incomes will face more economic pressure, such as renting a house, buying a house, transportation and costs of living.

2. Turnover Intention

The results of this study showed that the turnover intention of new graduate nurses was at a moderate level ($\overline{X}$ = 3.77, SD = .96) (Table 2). This result was consistent with two previous studies on turnover intention among new graduate nurses in Taiwan by Cheng et al. (2014) and in Canada by Laschinger (2012), both showing that new graduate nurses had a moderate level. However, compared with two other previous studies on new graduate nurses, the findings of this study showed that the level of turnover intention was higher; one of this study is from South

Korea by Lee et al. (2012) and the other is from Canada by Fallatah, Laschinger, and Read (2017); both studies results indicated that turnover intention was at a low level.

The results of this study can also be compared with some study with a sample of general nurses. This result is consistent with a study in Kunming, Yunnan Province by Li et al. (2011) which also indicated a moderate level. However, compared with the other two general nurse samples, a Korean study by Sung, Seo, and Kim (2012) and a Chinese study by Chen, Li, Li, Lv, and Zhang (2018) both showed a high level of turnover intention of nurses. The results of these comparisons show that different countries and regions, different sample attributes and so on, will produce different results.

To sum up, there are certain differences between the above-mentioned comparisons and foreign research results. Some results are relatively consistent, and some are inconsistent. Compared with Canada in the early years, the turnover intention of new graduate nurses in this study is higher than that of Canada and South Korea in similar years, which may be related to the different national conditions and policies of the country, and different compensation. In China, the salary level of nurses is relatively lower than that of European and American countries.

Explaining why the turnover intention of new graduate nurses is at a moderate level and why this level is not very low, but neither very high, could be done in two directions. First, some explanations to explain why the intention to leave is not very high: Many people nowadays like to pursue a high-quality living environment. Dali is an ideal place to live. The weather in Dali is pleasant, the seasons are all like spring, the air there is fresh and there is no smog. In recent years, the gradual improvement of transportation and infrastructure has not only welcomed many tourists, but also many graduates. The three hospitals are the three most powerful public hospitals in Dali, so they are also the first choice for nursing graduates. There are not only more learning opportunities in these hospitals but also more income opportunities.

The sample characteristics of this study could provide other reasonable explanations. A study showed that the higher the education level of a new graduate is, the more likely they are to leave (Lee et al., 2012). The education level of the whole sample in this study is not high, so the turnover intention was not at a high level. The proportion of bachelor's degrees is only 38.46%. In China today, most of the tertiary hospitals recruit nurses with at least a bachelor's degree and the bachelor's degree provides them with more advantages, such as taking a national civil service exam or going to a nursing school as a teacher (Nurse Network, 2018).

Another study proved that married nurses are more likely to leave (Cho, Lee, Mark, & Yun, 2012). In this study, only 30.77% of the new graduate nurses were married. Therefore, it is at a reasonably moderate level. Married nurses are more likely to quit, indicating that marriage increases family responsibilities and may lead to work-family conflicts. In addition, married nurses may be more likely to leave their job, perhaps because their income is only an additional income to the family, thus reducing the pressure on nurses to continue working (Cho et al., 2012).

Secondly, there are some explanations explain why the turnover level is not very low. Nurses are at great risk while working and dealing with life, and cannot tolerate the slightest mistakes, leading to a state of high tension in the long run and the large gap between nurses leads to a large workload for some nurses, as well as fewer holidays and more night shifts, which can be physically harmful. In a survey of more than 7,000 nurses in China, 90% said that they worked more than 8 hours a day; 80% did not have a weekend concept; 90% felt that they were in poor condition after work every day; and nearly 50% felt very tired (Modern Nursing, 2018). All these unfavorable reasons may lead to some turnover intention in new graduate nurses.

Another important point is that the nurse-patient relationship is tense. Nurses not only face heavy work every day, but they also carefully deal with relationships. In these cases, the pay of the nursing practitioners is not high, leading many nurses to leave their job and turn to other fields (Chinese Public Medical Examination, 2018). Nursing graduates may work in hospitals, clinics, universities and colleges. Graduates also have a large number of business opportunities (health tourism, rehabilitation products) and business development opportunities (establishing home care and child health centers).

In addition, the turnover intention of new graduate nurses not being low could be explained by the demographic characteristics of the sample. A previous study showed that new graduate nurses were more likely to leave their job when they were younger than 23 years old (Beecroft, Dorey, & Wenten, 2008). Nurses aged 20 to 25 accounted for 60% of the sample in this study. At this age band, most of them have just graduated and are in their first job. As mentioned in the background, some studies have shown that most new graduate nurses lack academic and practical skills, judgment, and decision-making skills, so graduates face enormous pressure and challenges in transitioning from school to their first working environment (Duchscher, 2009).

Another study compared the differences of new graduate nurses between the different periods of job orientation. The results showed that nurses with more than four weeks of job orientation period had lower turnover intention (Lee et al., 2012). Samples from the study showed that just 31.92% of new graduate nurses had received job orientation for more than 4 weeks and even more had received less than 4 weeks. If the new graduate nurses have more basic skills and a better familiarity with the work environment thanks to the job orientation period, the new graduate nurses could have better self-confidence at work.

3. The Relationship between Employee Well-being and Turnover Intention of Subjects

The results showed a significantly negative moderate relationship between employee well-being and turnover intention ($r = -.341$, $p < .01$) (Table 3). The findings indicated that employee well-being was related to turnover intention as perceived by new graduate nurses in Dali hospitals, the People's Republic of China. There is a negative linear relationship between employee well-being and turnover intention; as employee well-being increased, turnover intention decreased, which was consistent with prior studies (Brunetto, Teo, Shacklock, & Farr-

Wharton, 2012; Brunetto et al., 2013; Zheng et al., 2015; Amin & Akbar, 2013). This result can be explained by the turnover intention theoretical model proposed by Mobley (1977). Employees will have a rethinking process before deciding to leave a job. In this process, dissatisfaction caused by the current job will motivate employees to leave. After this discontent leads to turnover intention, employees begin to look for other job opportunities and compare all job opportunities; then the final reaction is quitting. When the new graduated nurses are not satisfied with their employee well-being during work, this will motivate their intention to leave their job.

As the results of this study show, all three dimensions of employee well-being had a significant negative correlation with turnover intention. First, the results showed a moderate negative relationship between life well-being and turnover intention ($r = -.307$, $p < .01$) (Table 3). According to Zheng et al.'s (2015) theoretical model, life well-being is mainly related to personal life-related emotions. This result can be explained that the more harmonious personal life is, the less intention there will be to quit. Through the investigation of the three hospitals, there are certain benefits to the life of the employees, such as transportation subsidies or the supply of some working meals, and some people enjoy a single dormitory; however, most people think that this is not enough. Therefore, it could be beneficial for some hospitals to implement more life care benefits for nurses.

Secondly, the results showed a moderate negative relationship between workplace well-being and turnover intention ($r = -.334$, $p < .01$) (Table 3). According to Zheng et al.'s (2015) theoretical model, workplace well-being is mainly related to work-related elements, such as compensation, labor protection, management style, and work arrangements. According to a survey of three hospitals, most of the departments have extra beds, which means the beds are beyond the original settings, and medical equipment is not sufficient. They often need to borrow equipment from other departments when they are busy. Therefore, any strategy to improve the working environment and conditions is beneficial to reduce employees' turnover intention.

Lastly, the results showed a weak negative relationship between psychological well-being and turnover intention ($r = -.267$, $p < .01$) (Table 3). According to Zheng et al.'s (2015) theoretical model, psychological well-being mainly focuses on learning, growth, work achievement, and self-actualization. For example, nurses often have the opportunity to go to other hospitals for studying and further education, but the number of places is limited. Most of these opportunities are given to senior nurses. Therefore, from this theory and research results, it is necessary to provide employees with more opportunities for learning, exchanging experiences and growing up.

In addition, this result can also be explained by the age of the sample. The average age of the sample is only about 25 years old. Not only do they lack experience and judgment affects their employee wellbeing, as mentioned before, but also youth is the capital of this sample. If the actual work deviates too far from their ideal state, they will more easily leave their current job impulsively to pursue other ideals, such as quitting to continue education, engaging in other industries, or going abroad, because it is easier for young people to reshape.

Conclusion

Employees start their career planning and development from the moment they step onto the job. On the road to their career development, employee well-being plays an important role in the long-term development of this field, so when the employee well-being index is high, it is not easy for the employee to quit.

Implications

The results of this study provide valuable information regarding the importance of employee well-being and turnover intention among new graduate nurses in Dali hospitals, the People's Republic of China. The results showed that the mean score of employee well-being of the subjects is lower than those in other fields, the turnover intention of the subjects at a moderate level and employee well-being had a significant impact on the subjects' turnover intention. Therefore, hospitals should promote and improve some strategies in order to improve employee well-being, which will help reduce the flow of nurses.

Hospital administrators should try to make more investments in living conveniences as well as in all aspects related to the working environment in order to improve both the life of its employees and the workplace well-being, with the objective of promoting the coordination between work and life and reducing the loss of employees. Hospital administrators should provide more programs to enhance employees' continuing education and offer international exchange opportunities in order to improve psychological well-being.

A head nurse should try their best to increase employee well-being in order to reduce the loss of new graduate nurses and improve the workplace environment as well as creating a safe, quiet and beautiful working environment. The head nurse should act as a good communication coordinator between nurses and patients and between nurses and doctors.

A nurse should perform his or her personal duties seriously; if any dissatisfaction or difficulties with work, life and psychology are encountered, this should be promptly communicated to the head nurse, negotiated, and resolved and a nurse should try their best to resist negative emotions in work and in life.

Recommendations for Further Research

Based on the results of this study, it is recommended to explore more factors related to turnover intention, so that nursing managers can better stabilize their nursing teams in the future, including, for example, demographic factors such as age and marital status; human factors such as skills and abilities; organizational factors such as organizational culture, and management factors such as motivation, compensation system, and performance evaluation methods.

In addition, this study only reflects on new graduate nurses working in three hospitals in Dali so these results cannot be generalized to all Chinese nurses; therefore, further research should focus on regions outside of Dali, at different levels of hospitals, or on some different attributes of the nurses in Dali. In addition, comparative studies could be conducted in

government hospitals and other private hospitals.

Acknowledgements

I express my deepest gratitude to The Faculty of Nursing, Chiang Mai University and The First Affiliated Hospital of Dali University, for giving me this opportunity to contribute to my personal and professional development.

References

Alexander, J. A., Lichtenstein, R., Oh, H. J., & Ullman, E. (1998). A causal model of voluntary turnover among nursing personnel in long-term psychiatric settings. *Research in Nursing & Health, 21*(5), 415-427.

Amin, Z., & Akbar, K. P. (2013). Analysis of psychological well-being and turnover intentions of hotel employees: An empirical study. *International Journal of Innovation and Applied Studies*, *3*(3), 662-671.

Baidu Library. (2018). *Hospital salary system*. Retrieved from https://wenku.baidu.com/view/4848dc9b767f5acfa0c7cd31.html?from=search

Beecroft, P. C., Dorey, F., & Wenten, M. (2008). Turnover intention in new graduate nurses: A multivariate analysis. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, *62*(1), 41-52.

Benner, P. (1984). *From novice to expert*. Menlo Park, CA: Addison-Wesley.

Boyd, A. (1997). Employee traps-corruption in the workplace. *Management Review*, *86*(8), 9-10.

Brunetto, Y., Teo, S. T., Shacklock, K., & Farr-Wharton, R. (2012). Emotional intelligence, job satisfaction, well-being and engagement: Explaining organizational commitment and turnover intentions in policing. *Human Resource Management Journal*, *22*(4), 428-441.

Brunetto, Y., Xerri, M., Shriberg, A., Farr-Wharton, R., Shacklock, K., Newman, S., & Dienger, J. (2013). The impact of workplace relationships on engagement, well-being, commitment and turnover for nurses in Australia and the USA. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, *69*(12), 2786-2799.

Buerhaus, P. I., Auerbach, D. I., & Staiger, D. O. (2009). The recent surge in nurse employment: Causes and implications. *Health Affairs*, *28*(4), w657-w668.

Chen, H., Li, G., Li, M., Lv, L., & Zhang, T. (2018). A cross-sectional study on nurse turnover intention and influencing factors in Jiangsu Province, China. *International Journal of Nursing Sciences*, *5*(4), 396-402. doi: 10.1016/j.ijnss.2018.09.012

Cheng, C. Y., Tsai, H. M., Chang, C. H., & Liou, S. R. (2014). New graduate nurses' clinical competence, clinical stress, and intention to leave: A longitudinal study in Taiwan. *The Scientific World Journal*, *2014*, Article ID 748389. doi: 10.1155/2014/748389

Chinese Public Medical Examination. (2018). *Only the nurses understand the sadness, why are more and more nurses considering changing careers?* Retrieved from http://dy.163.com/v2/article/detail/DHEJE9470516U8F3.html

Cho, S. H., Lee, J. Y., Mark, B. A., & Yun, S. C. (2012). Turnover of new graduate nurses in their first job using survival analysis. *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, *44*(1), 63-70.

De Gieter, S., Hofmans, J., & Pepermans, R. (2011). Revisiting the impact of job satisfaction and organizational commitment on nurse turnover intention: An individual differences analysis. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, *48*(12), 1562-1569.

Diener, E. D. (1984). Subjective well-being. *Psychological Bulletin*, *95*(3), 542.

Duchscher, J. B. (2008). A process of becoming: The stages of new nursing graduate professional role transition. *The Journal of Continuing Education in Nursing*, *39*(10), 441-450.

Duchscher, J. B. (2009). Transition shock: The initial stage of role adaptation for newly graduated registered nurses. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, *65*(5), 1103-1113.

Fallatah, F., Laschinger, H. K., & Read, E. A. (2017). The effects of authentic leadership, organizational identification, and occupational coping self-efficacy on new graduate nurses' job turnover intentions in Canada. *Nursing Outlook*, *65*(2), 172-183.

Fishbein, M., & Ajzen, I. (1975). *Belief, attitude, intention and behavior*: *An introduction to theory and research.* Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.

Gerrish, K. (2000). Still fumbling along? A comparative study of the newly qualified nurse's perception of the transition from student to qualified nurse. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, *32*(2), 473-480.

Giallonardo, L. M., Wong, C. A., & Iwasiw, C. L. (2010). Authentic leadership of preceptors: Predictor of new graduate nurses' work engagement and job satisfaction. *Journal of Nursing Management, 18*(8), 993-1003.

Hamilton, E. M., Murray, M. K., Lindholm, L. H., & Myers, R. E. (1989). Effects of mentoring on job satisfaction, leadership behaviors, and job retention of new graduate nurses. *Journal of Nursing Staff Development, 5*(4), 159-165.

Israel, G. D. (1992). *Determining sample size*. Hillsborough, FL: University of Florida Cooperative Extension Service, Institute of Food and Agriculture Sciences.

Jacobs, E. J., & Roodt, G. (2008). Organizational culture of hospitals to predict turnover intentions of professional nurses. *Health SA Gesondheid (Online)*, *13*(1), 63-78.

Kovner, C. T., Brewer, C. S., Yingrengreung, S., & Fairchild, S. (2010). New nurses' views of quality improvement education. *The Joint Commission Journal on Quality and Patient Safety*, *36*(1), 29-AP5.

Laschinger, H. K. S. (2012). Job and career satisfaction and turnover intentions of newly graduated nurses. *Journal of Nursing Management*, *20*(4), 472-484.

Laschinger, H. K. S., Grau, A. L., Finegan, J., & Wilk, P. (2012). Predictors of new graduate nurses' workplace well-being: Testing the job demands–resources model. *Health Care Management Review, 37*(2), 175-186.

Lee, H., Lim, Y., Jung, H. Y., & Shin, Y. W. (2012). Turnover intention of graduate nurses in South Korea. *Japan Journal of Nursing Science*, *9*(1), 63-75.

Li, L., Akkadechanunt, T., & Chontawan, R. (2011). *Professional practice environment and turnover intention among nurses in the general university hospitals, Yunnan Province, the people' s republic of China* (Unpublished master's thesis). Chiang Mai University, Thailand.

Lu, L., Kao, S. F., Siu, O. L., & Lu, C. Q. (2011). Work stress, Chinese work values, and work well-being in the greater China. *Journal of Social Psychology, 151*(6), 767–783.

Mark, G., & Smith, A. P. (2012). Occupational stress, job characteristics, coping, and the mental health of nurses. *British Journal of Health Psychology*, *17*(3), 505-521.

Mai, L. H., Zhai, J. G., Liao, M. F., & Huang, M. L. (2016). Analysis and countermeasures of the current situation of the loss of contemporary human resources. *International Journal of Nursing, 2.*

Mobley, W. H. (1977). Intermediate linkages in the relationship between job satisfaction and employee turnover. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, *62*(2), 237.

Modern Nursing. (2018). *Chinese nurse, why are you so tired?* Retrieved from https://www. jianshu.com/p/80755e641583

National Ministry of Health Statistics. (2016). *China's medical and health situation: Statistical bulletin on the development of health and family planning in China (2016)*. Retrieved from https://www.sohu.com/a/166601731_505926

Nurse Network. (2018). *As a nurse, where are the advantages of undergraduate nurses?* Retrieved from https://baijiahao.baidu.com/s?id=1609943086058049135& wfr=spider&for=pc

Nurses International. (2011). *The hospital nursing shortage-Bullet points and statistics*. (Consulted on February 1, 2011). Retrieved from http://www.nursesinternational.us/hospitalnursingshortage.html

Ortiz, J. (2016). New graduate nurses' experiences about lack of professional confidence. *Nurse Education in Practice, 19*, 19-24.

Oulton, J. A. (2006). The global nursing shortage: An overview of issues and actions. *Policy, Politics, & Nursing Practice*, *7*(Suppl. 3), 34S-39S.

Pack, T. G., Roessler, R. T., Turner, R., & Robertson, J. (2007). Prediction of turnover intentions among employed adults with multiple sclerosis. *Journal of Rehabilitation, 73*(3), 26.

Parker, V., Giles, M., Lantry, G., & McMillan, M. (2014). New graduate nurses' experiences in their first year of practice. *Nurse Education Today, 34*(1), 150-156.

People's Health Network. (2018). *The total number of registered nurses in China exceeds 3.8 million. The ratio of medical care reaches 1: 1.1*. Retrieved from http://health.people.com.cn/n1/2018/0511/c14739-29980199.html

Ryu, G. (2016). Public employees' well-being when having long working hours and low-salary working conditions. *Public Personnel Management*, *45*(1), 70-89.

Spreitzer, G., & Porath, C. (2012). Creating sustainable performance. *Harvard Business Review*, *90*(1), 92-99.

Sung, K., Seo, Y., & Kim, J. H. (2012). Relationships between compassion fatigue, burnout, and turnover intention in Korean hospital nurses. *Journal of Korean Academy of Nursing*, *42*(7), 1087-1094.

Takase, M. (2010). A concept analysis of turnover intention: Implications for nursing management. *Collegian, 17*(1), 3-12.

Vogelpohl, D. A., Rice, S. K., Edwards, M. E., & Bork, C. E. (2013). New graduate nurses' perception of the workplace: Have they experienced bullying? *Journal of Professional Nursing, 29*(6), 414-422.

Wang, H. L., Zhang X., & Liu C. F. (2003). Talking about the clinical advantages of on-the-job nurses with high education. *China International Journal of Nursing, 3*, 206-207.

Wang, J., & Wang, Y. (2016). The impact of character strengths on employee well-being: The mediating effect of work-family relationship. *World Academy of Science, Engineering and Technology, International Journal of Social, Behavioral, Educational, Economic, Business and Industrial Engineering*, *10*(5), 1600-1608.

Warr, P. (2007). Searching for happiness at work. *Psychologist Leicester*, *20*(12), 726.

Xu, A. Y., Ding, Y. L., Lv, L. M., Wen, H., & Li, H. J. (2016). Analysis of the status quo and reasons of nurses leaving in a top three hospital. *International Journal of Nursing, 35(6).*

Yamane, T. (1973). *Statistics: An introductory analysis* (3rd ed.). New York: Harper and Row.

Yang, H. Y., Yan, H., Zhou, X., Wang, Z. Y., & Lv, J. W. (2014). Investigation on the current situation of 721 clinical nurses' willingness to leave. *Chinese Hospital Management, 34*(2), 61-63.

Zheng, X., & Liu, X. (2016). The effect of interactional justice on employee well-being: The mediating role of psychological empowerment and the moderating role of power distance. *Acta Psychological Sinica*, *48*(6), 693-709. doi: 10.3724/SP.J.1041.2016.00693

Zheng, X., Zhu, W., Zhao, H., & Zhang, C. (2015). Employee well-being in organizations: Theoretical model, scale development, and cross-cultural validation. *Journal of Organizational Behavior, 36(5), 621-644.*